

Report of the University Structure and Governance Committee (USGC) on Charge S-1908

Charge: Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Selection Process: Consider possible improvements to our policy and processes for selection of recipients of Honorary Degrees and Commencement Speakers.

Background

The University administration in 2014 asked the Senate to recommend a process for the University to incorporate input from the community in selecting recipients of honorary degrees and in recommending commencement speakers. The Senate Executive Committee provided an initial response in the form of the report on charge S-1405 (Appendix A). The University Structure and Governance Committee (USGC) was subsequently requested in charge S-1410 to study the recommendations of S-1405 and formulate detailed processes for their implementation. Following the adoption by the Senate of the processes recommended by USGC in November 2015, President Barchi requested that they be amended to include deadlines reflecting the need for timely action in light of the need to invite recipients and speakers far in advance. A modified report on this charge was adopted by the Senate in February 2016 (Appendix B). Charge S-1908 was initiated to determine whether the process requires or would benefit from any changes or improvements.

The key components of the recommended procedures, which have been in operation since Fall 2016, are that:

- the Senate Executive Committee at its September meeting each year appoints members of a representative University Commencement Panel (UCP) of senators
- the UCP recommends three faculty and two student senators from the respective units to serve on Chancellor's Committee on the Camden, Newark, New Brunswick/RBHS (combined) campuses
- the Chancellors of Camden, Newark, New Brunswick/RBHS (jointly) appoint Commencement Committees consisting of the five recommended senators and four additional designees of their own.

The recommendations in the (amended) report on charge S-1410 contain additional details regarding creation of the (then) new UCP and its composition, solicitations of nominations, the selection process carried out by the Chancellors' Commencement Committees (CCCs), etc.



Considerations

As these procedures have been in operation over the course of five years, several difficulties have emerged, giving rise to the current charge to consider improvements.

1. The USGC recommendation for the representative appointment of the UCP each year was:

The UCP will be composed of members with representation from each unit (R-C, R-N, R-NB, RBHS), as follows:

- a. Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting)
- b. Vice Chair of the Senate (chair of UCP)
- c. Four Faculty Senators, with each of the following groups being represented:
 - Tenure-track (TT), non-tenure-track (NTT), and part-time lecturers (PTL)
- d. One Staff Senator
- e. One Alumni Senator
- f. Two Student Senators

Unfortunately, the resolution adopted by the Senate adding the UCP into the Senate Handbook incorporated an earlier draft of that recommendation:

University Commencement Panel Standing Charge: The University Commencement Panel (UCP) shall be appointed by the Executive Committee at the beginning of each year and shall consist of the Vice Chair of the Senate, serving as chair of the UCP; four faculty senators (one each from Camden, Newark, New Brunswick, and RBHS, and including at least one tenure-track, one non-tenure-track, and one part-time lecturer senator); two student senators; one staff senator; one alumni senator; and the Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting).

The key difference is this: the recommendation aimed that the UCP as a whole would be representative of all campuses, and required that the faculty members include TT, NTT, and PTL representatives. The resolution as adopted incorporates the additional burden that the faculty members alone must represent each of the campuses.

Experience has shown that the call for nominations for the UCP generates relatively few volunteers in general—perhaps because the UCP is not, in fact, directly involved in considering recommendations for recipients of honorary degrees or commencement speakers, but only in selecting those who will be appointed by the Chancellors to do this work. However, in conjunction with the fact that the conditions adopted are more restrictive than they should have been, it has been difficult in practice for the Senate Executive Committee to appoint the UCP. There has often been limited choice and flexibility, especially as regards trying to find four faculty members from among the volunteers, subject to the



seven constraints as to both campus (Camden, Newark, New Brunswick, RBHS) and status (TT, NTT, PTL).

- 2. The Senate chair and vice-chair met with President Barchi to ask how this process is viewed by the administration and whether he felt that any improvements were needed. President Barchi indicated that the process itself was helpful and works but could be improved. The administration's main issue with the Senate process is that often potential recipients who have been invited have scheduling conflicts and are not available when asked by the University. Thus it is critical that the CCCs are able to begin their work sooner and continue it when necessary after the first round of requests. In practice, the UCP is currently appointed in September, solicits nominations for service on the various CCCs, and meets to make recommendations to the Chancellors. It has usually been possible to complete this by November, occasionally December or October. Nevertheless, the time that this takes hold up the procedures whereby the Secretary of the University invites the community to propose potential honorary degree recipients or commencement speakers, to be considered by the respective CCCs.
- 3. In addition, when such calls are issued, they are not for commencements in the following May, but for the year after that. The process as a whole is timeconsuming. The CCCs send ranked recommendations to the Chancellors, but then the University administration must begin the process of inviting recipients and speakers a year or more ahead of time, and yet must be able to respond if and when some of those who have accepted drop out, for whatever reason. The detailed procedures set out in the report on charge S-1410 do not specify terms for the CCCs. Under the existing procedures, new recommendations for CCC members are provided by the UCP around November, and the Chancellors appoint the CCCs (including their own four designees) at some time thereafter. It is therefore not clear when a CCC is expected to hand over to its successor. Members appointed in one Fall may no longer be Senators the following Fall. Student members may have graduated. As has happened several times in recent years, speakers may unavoidably drop out only shortly before the date of commencement; in such cases, if the ranked list provided by a previouslyserving CCC has been exhausted, it is not clear what Senate involvement is required for any remedial actions to be taken by the University administration, or what role, if any, a successor CCC is expected to play.



Recommendations

These issues were discussed by the USGC in 2019–2020, and the development of recommendations was under way, but no conclusions were reached before the final committee meetings of the year were lost to the COVID-19 pandemic. They were thus taken up afresh by the current USGC. Discussion initially focused on resolving the unplanned complexity of the requirements for the UCP, bringing the timing of the UCP's appointment forward to the final Senate Executive Committee meeting of the previous year (June) instead of the first meeting of the subsequent year (September), and defining a term for the CCCs.

An initial set of draft recommendations was under discussion, as follows:

1. The original USGC recommendation for the representative appointment of the UCP should be adopted; namely:

The UCP will be composed of members with representation from each unit (R-C, R-N, R-NB, RBHS), as follows:

- a. Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting)
- b. Vice Chair of the Senate (chair of UCP)
- c. Four Faculty Senators, with each of the following groups being represented:
 - Tenure-track (TT), non-tenure-track (NTT), and part-time lecturers (PTL)
- d. One Staff Senator
- e. One Alumni Senator
- f. Two Student Senators
- 2. Each year, the outgoing University Senate Executive Committee should solicit nominations from the incoming University Senate for membership on the UCP, and at its final meeting of the year it should appoint members to the UCP from among those nominations
- 3. The UCP should solicit nominations from new and continuing senators to serve on the following year's Chancellors' Commencement Committees and make recommendations to the Chancellors by September each year.
- 4. No change is need in the composition or duties of the CCCs.
- 5. If the above recommendations are accepted by the University, then the handbook of the Rutgers University Senate should be amended to replace Article VIII.D section 11 with:

"11. University Commencement Panel Standing Charge: The University Commencement Panel (UCP) shall be appointed by the Executive Committee at its final meeting of each year from volunteers solicited from among new and returning senator for the following year. It shall include representation from the Camden, Newark, New Brunswick and RBHS campuses, and shall consist of the Vice Chair of the Senate, serving as chair of the UCP; four faculty senators (including at least one tenure-track, one non-tenure-track, and one part-time lecturer senator); two student senators; one staff senator; one alumni senator; and the Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting). Members will be



appointed to this panel in addition to their regular committee duties, with the following responsibilities:

- Identify and select faculty and student senators to serve on the Camden, Newark, and New Brunswick/RBHS Commencement Committees (which vet and rank nominations for honorary degrees and for commencement speakers), as follows:
 - o three faculty senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
 - o two student senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
- Advise the chancellors no later than the beginning of September of the names of those selected for appointment."

In more recent discussions, however, several additional concerns surfaced. Although the above proposal would resolve the unintended complexity of the UCP, and significantly improve the timing of recommendations to the Chancellors, some delay in forming and starting up the CCCs in September would still remain; and the issues relating to CCC terms were still not addressed. In addition, the prevailing view in the current USGC is that the UCP as a whole is an unnecessary complexity. It is required to be representative, and its role is only to recommend senators to serve on CCCs. It does not attract significant number of volunteers—and some of those who do volunteer do so in error, as they actually prefer to serve on their CCC. The conclusion of this discussion was that the Executive Committee itself is elected by senators and is already required to be representative, and that it would not place an undue burden on the Executive Committee to require them to solicit and consider nominations for CCCs and recommend senators to serve on them directly to the Chancellors, instead of spending time appointing the UCP. Further, if this were to be done at the final (June) meeting each year, it should be possible for Chancellors to appoint the CCCs even earlier.

There was some support for the notion that service on a CCC might be tied to specific commencements rather than fixed terms. This would have advantages in relation to the need to have senators and others for the University administration to work with when changes had to be made late in the day. However, there can be no guarantee that that senators—particularly students, who have one year-terms—who serve on a CCC that ranks and recommends honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers will still be serving as senators by the time of that commencement perhaps over a year later. Conversely, if the Executive Committee can recommend senators to Chancellors to serve on their CCCs by June each year, it may be realistic for CCCs to be appointed for one-year terms from July 1 each year. Nothing prevents a serving CCC member from volunteering to serve again in the following year, and Chancellors remain free to select their own designees with continuity in mind. Such a scheme offers simplicity and



clarity, as well as consistency with senate terms. Each CCC would vet potential recipients and speakers for a commencement that would be towards the end of the year following its term; but its term would continue until the end of June, and the CCC would be available to be consulted by the University administration regarding remedial actions in the event of needing to replace a speaker close to the time of an imminent commencement.

In light of these discussions, the USGS's recommendations are:

- 1. The appointing of a UCP should be discontinued, and references to the UCP should be removed from the Senate Handbook.
- 2. Each year, the outgoing University Senate Executive Committee should solicit nominations from the incoming University Senate for membership on the Chancellors' Commencement Committees (CCCs), and at its final meeting of the year it should select, from among those nominations for CCCs, three faculty members and two students for each of the CCCs, and should advise the Chancellors accordingly.
- 3. The composition and duties of CCCs, as well as the process for selection process for honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers should remain as set forth in the amended report on charge S-1410 adopted in February 2016.
- 4. CCCs should be appointed for one-year terms commencing each year on July 1.
- 5. In the event that it becomes necessary to select honorary degree recipients or commencement speakers after the recommendations provided by a CCC that is no longer serving have been exhausted, the University administration should consult with the CCC for the affected campus(es) serving at the time that action is needed.
- 6. If these recommendations are accepted by the University, the Senate Handbook should be amended accordingly.



Resolutions

Be it resolved that the Rutgers University Senate

endorses the following modifications to the process set out in the report on Charge S-1410 to select honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers and asks the University administration to implement them:

- 1. Each year, the outgoing University Senate Executive Committee should solicit nominations from the incoming University Senate for membership on the Chancellors' Commencement Committees (CCCs), and at its final meeting of the year it should select, from among those nominations for CCCs, three faculty members and two students for each of the CCCs, and should advise the Chancellors accordingly.
- 2. The composition and duties of CCCs, as well as the process for selection process for honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers should remain as set forth in the amended report on charge S-1410 adopted in February 2016.
- 3. CCCs should be appointed for one-year terms commencing each year on July 1.
- 4. In the event that it becomes necessary to select honorary degree recipients or commencement speakers after the recommendations provided by a CCC that is no longer serving have been exhausted, the University administration should consult with the CCC for the affected campus(es) serving at the time that action is needed.

Be it further resolved that if these recommendations are accepted by the University, then the Handbook of the Rutgers University Senate should be updated as follows:

- 1. In Article VII. B., the sentence "The vice chair acts as chair of the Appeals Panel if an appeal is being heard, and reports on Executive Committee action at Senate meetings." should replace the sentence "The vice chair acts as chair of the University Commencement Panel and of the Appeals Panel if an appeal is being heard, and reports on Executive Committee action at Senate meetings."
- 2. In Article VIII. A., the sentence "Procedures concerning the structure and operation of committees were approved by the University Senate on May 5, 1974, and amended April 28, 1995 and February 19, 2016." should be replaced with the sentence "Procedures concerning the structure and operation of committees were approved by the University Senate on May 5, 1974, and



amended April 28, 1995, February 19, 2016, and [INSERT DATE OF THIS AMENDMENT'S ADOPTION]."

3. iii) In Article VIII. D., delete the following text:

"11. University Commencement Panel Standing Charge: The University Commencement Panel (UCP) shall be appointed by the Executive Committee at the beginning of each year and shall consist of the Vice Chair of the Senate, serving as chair of the UCP; four faculty senators (one each from Camden, Newark, New Brunswick, and RBHS, and including at least one tenure-track, one non-tenure-track, and one part-time lecturer senator); two student senators; one staff senator; one alumni senator; and the Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting). Members will be appointed to this panel in addition to their regular committee duties, with the following responsibilities:

- Identify and select faculty and student senators to serve on the Camden, Newark, and New Brunswick/RBHS Commencement Committees (which vet and rank nominations for honorary degrees and for commencement speakers), as follows:
 - o three faculty senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
 - o two student senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
- Advise the chancellors no later than the beginning of September of the names of those selected for appointment."

University Structure and Governance Committee 2020 - 2021

Gillett, Peter, RBS:UNB (F) - Chair

Adya, Monica, Business-Camden Dean (A)

Ahmed, Amna, SAS -NB (S)

Alexander-Floyd, Nikol, SGS (F)

Ameri, Mason, RBS:UNB (F)

Bogden, John, RBHS-At Large

Castaneda, Ricky, NCAS (S)

Dane, Perry, Camden Law (F)

Farley, Alisa, SAS-NB (S)

Haliktis, Perry, SPH Dean (A)

Hodes, Rachel, Alumni Association

Hsueh, Wayne, RBHS At-Large (F)

Huang, Bingru, SGS-NB (F)

Lyles, Rhonda, RBHS Staff

Mahon, Gwendolyn, SHP Dean (A)

Menifield, Charles, SPAA Dean (A)

McCarthy, Bill, SCJ Dean (A)

Mickelsen, Mary, Senate Executive Secretary

Morton, Patricia, SAS-NB (F)

Mucherson, Kimberly, Law-Camden Dean (A)

Nath, Badri, SAS-NB (F)

Oliver, Jon, New Brunswick Staff

Ozel, Tugrul, School of Enigineering (F)

Parsa, Houshang, Alumni Association

Rivera, Alicia, RBHS Staff

Sacks, Bryan, PTL-C (F)

Schroth, Kevin, Other-RBHS (F)

Shinbrot, Troy, Engineering (F)

Shobut, Sarah, SAS-N (S)

Thakuriah, Piyushimita, EJBSPPP Dean (A)

Trees, Frances, SAS-NB (F)

Vellangany, Issac, SEBS (F)

Wayne, Robert, NJMS (S)



APPENDIX A

University Senate Executive Committee

Response to Charge S-1405 on Procedures for Selecting Commencement Speakers and Honorary Degree Recipients

A. Charge

S-1405 Procedures for Selecting Commencement Speakers and Honorary Degree Recipients: Consider, and make recommendations to ensure that, the procedure for selecting Commencement speakers, as well as those who receive honorary degrees, seeks and provides sufficient opportunity for input from the Rutgers community.

B. Summary

The University Senate Executive Committee, on behalf of the University Senate, examined the guidelines (both prior and current) in place at Rutgers for selecting honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers. The committee also examined those policies established at 15 fellow Association of American Universities (AAU) or Committee on Institutional Cooperation (CIC) members. At most of these institutions, the responsibility for selecting honorary degree recipients rests with the administration. At several, however, the process includes substantial participation by the faculty or university senate or faculty council. Where specified, commencement or convocation speakers are selected from those receiving honorary degrees or are nominated by students or the university community in a separate process.

Given the unique position of the Rutgers University Senate as the sole shared-governance body with university-wide representation of all constituencies (faculty, staff, students, alumni and administrators), as well as our desire to further integrate the Senate with its unique perspective into the fabric of the University, the Executive Committee recommends the establishment of the Rutgers University Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees, with membership to include representatives of each campus and constituency, jointly selected by the Senate leadership and university upper administration. As is current practice, commencement speakers will be selected from among those receiving honorary degrees, but the Executive Committee also recommends that Rutgers consider the feasibility of decoupling the awarding of honorary degrees from the selection of commencement speakers.

C. Background

The selection of Condoleezza Rice as honorary degree recipient and speaker at the 2014 Rutgers University–New Brunswick and Rutgers Biomedical and Health Sciences (RBHS)

commencement resulted in much controversy throughout the University community. In response to the announcement, the faculty, students, and governing bodies at Rutgers engaged in spirited discussion and debate regarding Dr. Rice's selection. The controversy generated considerable media attention, much of which was negative.

In consideration of this specific controversy, the University Senate community, in concert with the New Brunswick Faculty Council and other groups, found that an issue of equal or greater disquiet to Condoleezza Rice's selection was the selection process itself. It was evident that appropriate input from the University community had not been solicited, and that, had it been, a less controversial figure would likely have been selected. Such decisions, when made through a process lacking transparency and open consultation, or outside of the traditional Rutgers procedures for selecting commencement speakers and honorary degree recipients, essentially deny the opportunity for free and open discourse within the University community on a matter which has national or global implications for the reputation of Rutgers generally.

Until 2012, a Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees, which included representatives from all three campuses appointed by the president, was tasked to solicit nominations for the honorary degree recipients and commencement speaker about 18 months in advance of commencement, and then to confidentially prepare a slate of candidates. The composition of this committee was changed in 2013 to include the University president, the New Brunswick and RBHS chancellors, a member of the Board of Governors, a member of the Board of Trustees, and two professors. Please note that the selection committee at Rutgers, regardless of structure, serves to advise the Board of Governors. Any confidential slate of candidates prepared by the selection committee is forwarded to the Board of Governors for final selection.

The questions remain: Does the current process provide sufficient input from students who are the celebrants of commencement, and the faculty who shepherd them through the educational process? And, if not, how may this be remedied? In an attempt to determine answers to those questions, the University Senate Executive Committee decided at its March 2014 Committee meeting that the Senate would call for a review of the process and procedures relating to selection of commencement speakers and honorary degree recipients, and the charge that appears at the beginning of this report was issued.

D. Discussion

Rutgers policy for selection of honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers

In guidelines in place prior to 2013¹, a committee entitled the "Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees" solicited nominations for honorary degree recipients and commencement speaker approximately 18 months in advance of university commencement, which, until 2014, included the celebration of candidates from the Camden, Newark, and New Brunswick campuses. The committee reviewed the nominations and, in consultation with the President, presented a final slate for review by the Board of Governors' Committee on University Relations and Honorary

¹ Appendix I: Guidelines on Honorary Degrees and Commencement Speakers (prior to 2013).

Degrees.² The board committee then made a final recommendation on the honorary degree candidates and commencement speaker to the full Board of Governors for final approval. Members of the Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees included faculty representatives of each campus and several students. Faculty participation on this committee dwindled in recent years. For example, the number of faculty participants declined from 16 in 2009 to 8 in 2013.

In 2013, membership of the selection committee, now entitled the "Committee on Honorary Degrees," changed, although committee responsibilities and process did not. The following January, it was announced that Camden and Newark would hold commencement celebrations separate from that of New Brunswick/RBHS. At present, the Committee on Honorary Degrees includes the University president, the New Brunswick and RBHS chancellors, a member of the Board of Governors, a member of the Board of Trustees, and two faculty members. This committee serves to select the honorary degree recipients awarded at the Rutgers University–New Brunswick and RBHS commencement and, as previously, to advise the Rutgers Board of Governors. Modifications were also made to the Guidelines on Honorary Degrees as posted to the Rutgers Office of the Secretary of the University website³. In the current Rutgers guidelines⁴, a deadline for nominations is not specified, and a paragraph in the previous policy that addressed the selection of the commencement speaker⁵ has been deleted.

Given that Camden and Newark now have separate commencement ceremonies, they have developed their own processes for selecting commencement speakers and honorary degree recipients. For the 2014 and 2015 commencement ceremonies in Camden, the vice chancellor solicited nominations for honorary degree recipients from the Camden community in January of 2014⁶. The chancellor appointed a committee consisting of the vice chancellor as well as faculty representing each academic unit (law school, nursing school, business school, and the school of arts and sciences). The committee vetted four or five nominees, and presented a ranked list to the chancellor, who then forwarded his recommendation(s) for the honorary degree recipient (who is also commencement speaker) to the Board of Governors. For the 2014 ceremony at Rutgers-Newark, the chancellor solicited nominations from among the campus academic and administrative leadership. Two outstanding candidates were identified: one was found to have been awarded an honorary degree by Rutgers previously; the nomination packet for the second was reviewed and approved by the Rutgers University-Newark Honorary Degrees Committee. This committee included seven faculty members as well as the vice chancellor for public affairs. The nomination proceeded from there in accordance with the University system-wide nomination process described above. The Newark chancellor has plans to reconstitute this same committee for the commencement ceremony in 2015.

Guidelines for honorary degree recipients formulated by AAUs and members of the CIC

² The Board committee that currently recommends honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers to the full board is the Committee on Alumni and University Relations.

³ Revised policy: Guidelines on Honorary Degrees (2013). http://universitysecretary.rutgers.edu/honorary-degree-nomination-process

⁴ Appendix II: Revised policy: Guidelines on Honorary Degrees (2013)

⁵ From Appendix I: "Commencement Speaker. Since the commencement speaker will also be awarded an honorary degree, nominations for a speaker should follow the same guidelines as honorary degree candidates."

http://fas.camden.rutgers.edu/2014/02/18/call-for-honorary-degree-recipient-nominations/; http://news.rutgers.edu/news/announcing-rutgers-camden-commencement-and-honors-convocation-ceremony-and-call-honorary-degree/20140123

A survey of policies posted to the websites of a group of universities that includes fellow members of the AAU and CIC showed that procedures for selection of honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers at those institutions vary. At most universities, the honorary degree process is coordinated by the university administration, such as the office of the secretary of the university, the office of the vice president or provost, the Board of Trustees, or the Board of Regents. In most cases, the selection committee includes faculty and administrators in varying ratios, and is representative of the schools or colleges that comprise the university. Some, including the University of Michigan, include students and alumni. At most of the universities surveyed, the nomination committee serves to advise the chancellor, university president, or governing board. In several of the universities reviewed, however, a senate or faculty council committee gathers nomination materials and forwards nominations to the senate or council for action, or to the chancellor, president, and/or governing board directly.

Specifically, the Ohio State University Senate, subject to the authority of the board of trustees, has the power to recommend to the board the candidates for honorary degrees. The selection committee consists of seven regular, tenure-track faculty members, with no more than two faculty members from the same college. Each member serves a term of five years. The duties of this committee are to establish nomination procedures and criteria, receive and review nominations, and report to the university senate, which then votes by ballot, the results of which are advisory to the president. The president then forwards the name(s) of suitable candidates to the board of trustees.

At the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, the Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees, consisting of seven senators (five faculty and two students), meets twice a year and recommends candidates to the senate for approval prior to forwarding to the provost or chancellor. Commencement speakers at Illinois are not necessarily recipients for honorary degrees. Other institutions that require approval of a faculty body (senate or faculty council) prior to administrative review include the University of Nebraska-Lincoln (here, faculty senate members vote by secret ballot) and Indiana University. Undesirable aspects of policies that require approval by a substantial membership include possible issues with confidentiality, and the voting process, which may prove cumbersome.

The process at the University of Illinois-Chicago, a public research institution, is more defined. There, the Senate External Affairs Committee serves as advisory to the Chancellor and Board of Trustees. The nominating committee consists of the chair of the Senate External Affairs Committee, three senior faculty selected by the Senate, one representative of the provost's office, and one student. The process follows a specific timeline of several years. No more than three honorary degrees are awarded each year. The senate committee forwards nomination packets to the office of the chancellor, who reviews the list of nominees, and consults with the president, trustees, and key advisors to ensure that the final nominees are acceptable. The desired candidates are then forwarded to the board of trustees for approval.

⁷ Appendix III: Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Selection Processes: Universities representing the Committee on Institutional Cooperation (CIC) and Public AAUs

The Senate All-University Awards Committee at the University of Minnesota has greater representation. In addition to seven faculty members, the committee consists of the chair, three students, two representatives of civil service, five alumni, two academic professionals, and six administrators who serve *ex officio*. This committee meets and reviews potential honorary degree recipients six months prior to commencement. The approval process proceeds from the awards committee to the president and then to the board of regents.

Guidelines for commencement speakers formulated by AAUs and members of the CIC

The processes used to solicit speakers for commencement at surveyed institutions is less evident. Where specifically stated on university websites, commencement speakers may be chosen from among the honorary degree recipients by the president, chancellor, or governing body, or may be selected in a process different from that for honorary degrees. At Michigan State University, nominations for commencement speakers are solicited from among the student body, and pools of nominees are shared with the university president, who then makes the final decision. At the University of Chicago, convocations are held four times per year, and it is customary that speakers at each event are selected by college deans from among the faculty of the University. At the University of Illinois-Chicago, each college selects a separate commencement speaker.

E. Recommendations

It is clear that, given recent changes in University structure and the replacement of a university-wide commencement by three separate campus-based commencements, a new policy inclusive of adequate representation of faculty, students, staff, and alumni is needed. In keeping with the desire for free and open discourse within the Rutgers community, the Senate makes the following recommendations for a revised policy for selection of honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers:

- 1. In light of Rutgers' commitment to robust shared governance as presented in the 2014 Rutgers University Strategic Plan, the Rutgers policy should follow a model similar to that of several fellow AAU/CIC institutions by establishing a University Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees. The Senate is the one shared-governance body with university-wide representation of all constituencies (faculty, staff, students, and alumni), and is well suited to address such issues of university-wide importance.
- 2. The committee roster for the University Senate Committee on Honorary would consist of faculty, administrators, student leaders, staff, at least one alumnus, and the Executive Secretary of the Senate, with the membership being representative of all four campuses. The committee is best co-chaired by two of the University Senate Executive Committee's faculty members, each from a different campus. Since terms for Senators are limited, we recommend that members' terms are for a period of one academic year, with the possibility of serving an unlimited number of additional terms.
- 3. Other than the co-chairs, committee members may or may not be selected from among the Senate body, and will be jointly approved for inclusion by the Senate leadership (Senate chair and vice chair) and the administration. University Policies enabling the Senate, and Senate bylaws, will

be amended to reflect addition of this committee.

- 4. The Office of the Secretary of the University will solicit nominations for honorary degree recipients and commencement speaker from the entire University community on an ongoing basis, directing that all nomination packets, regardless of who prepared the nomination, will be sent to the Executive Secretary of the Senate for consideration by the Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees. The nomination process, nomination criteria, forms, and links should be posted on the website maintained by the Office of the Secretary of the University. Nominators are free to indicate for which of the campus commencements they believe their nominee would be most appropriate, although this is not required.
- 5. The Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees will meet twice yearly (mid-spring and mid-fall) to review nomination materials compiled by the University Senate office. Strict confidentiality regarding the names and credentials of nominees shall be observed. Confidentiality agreements will be executed, signed, and maintained.
- 6. For the New Brunswick/RBHS commencement, the packets of committee-approved candidates will be ranked and submitted in a timely fashion to the New Brunswick and RBHS chancellors who, in consultation with the president, will forward their selection(s) to the Board of Governors' Committee on Alumni and University Relations. As is current practice, the Committee on Alumni and University Relations will forward the names of honorary degree recipients to the Board of Governors for approval.
- 7. For Camden and Newark campuses, the respective Newark or Camden committee on honorary degrees shall be given an opportunity, through their campus representative(s) on the Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees, to select from the list of vetted nominees those honorary degree recipients considered suitable for their campus. As in current practice in Newark and Camden, the campus committee shall review, rank, and forward names to the campus chancellor, who will then forward the names of nominees to the Rutgers Board of Governors for approval. Strict confidentiality regarding the names and credentials of nominees shall be observed by the campus committees.
- 8. To ensure a smooth and thorough process, the Committee on Honorary Degrees will prepare a brief report of the nominees for the Senate leadership (Senate chair and vice chair) and the president, and that report will remain confidential, and will require no response or input.
- 9. Other aspects of the selection process (criteria, confidentiality, exceptions, nomination form, and notice to successful degree recipients by the president) will remain as in the current policy and shall apply to all parties and campuses involved in the process.
- 10. Currently, commencement speakers are chosen from the pool of honorary degree candidates. As long as these candidate packets are reviewed by a committee that has appropriate constituent representation, this process may continue. However, given that three commencement speakers are needed each year, the University administration should consider the feasibility of

⁸ This should include nominations made by members of the Rutgers governing boards. Although the final decision rests with the Board of Governors, we believe it is very important that the Board hear the advice of the Rutgers community, through the Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees, before making their decision.

decoupling the awarding of honorary degrees from the selection of commencement speakers. Under such a model, the New Brunswick and RBHS campuses combined, and the Newark and Camden campuses individually, may each continue/devise a process for selecting their commencement speaker (for recommendation to the Board of Governors), who may or may not be selected from the pool of honorary degree recipients, as they see fit. These processes should follow certain fundamental guidelines to ensure appropriate input and representation of faculty, students, administrators, staff, and alumni.

11. A charge will be issued to the University Senate's University Structure and Governance Committee to work with the University administration to specify details of the processes, including which parties and offices shall be responsible for each step of the process, how they shall be performed, and on what schedule. The current policy, modified to include greater representation of faculty and students, in place at Rutgers may remain until this process can be evaluated, implemented, and completed.

Rutgers University Senate Executive Committee members:

Ann Gould, Chairperson, SEBS, Faculty
Martha Cotter, Vice Chairperson, At-Large NB, Faculty
Robert Barraco, Alumni Association
Robert Boikess, SAS-NB, Faculty
Natalie Borisovets, Libraries, Faculty
Sherry Burrell, At-Large Camden, Faculty
Amoli Joshi, SPH, Student
Jerome Langer, RWJMS, Faculty
George Meggali, NCAS Student
Jon Oliver, NB Staff
Jane Otto, Libraries, Faculty
Robert Puhak, FAS-N, Faculty
Karen Thompson, PTL-NB, Faculty
Vetri Velan, Engineering, Student



GUIDELINES ON HONORARY DEGREES AND COMMENCEMENT SPEAKERS

Honorary Degrees and Commencement Speaker

The university's Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees (Committee), appointed by the President and consisting of representatives from all three campuses, meets each fall to consider nominations of individuals to receive honorary degrees and to select a commencement speaker. Because this process involves extensive administrative planning and coordination of schedules with the recipients, the Committee begins its work approximately 18 months in advance of the commencement date. For example, the Committee that met in fall 2008 selected the honorary degree recipients and speaker for University Commencement 2010.

The Committee invites nominations from any member of the university community or the public and pares down the list of nominees over the course of several meetings to produce a slate of candidates. In consultation with the President, the Committee then presents a final slate for review by the Board of Governors' Committee on University Relations and Honorary Degrees. The board committee then makes a final recommendation on the honorary degree candidates and commencement speaker to the full Board of Governors for their approval.

Criteria for Awarding an Honorary Degree by Rutgers University

The nominee for an honorary degree from Rutgers University:

- 1. Must evidence outstanding achievement in the humanities, arts, or sciences, or in a profession; in government, public affairs, education, or religion; in industry or commerce; or in an auxiliary field or endeavor.
- 2. Must evidence distinguished service and performance in his or her accomplishments that support the ideals of Rutgers and serve as an example to our students, our alumni, and society.
- 3. Must evidence in his or her life a commitment of service to humankind.

Honorary degrees will be bestowed by the President at the University Commencement ceremony, or by the President, or a designee, at other university commencement ceremonies or special events. Degrees may be awarded in four categories based on the specific criteria listed below:

Doctor of Laws

Distinguished service to state or to nation, to learning or to humankind, coupled with intellectual gifts and moral qualities that entitle the recipient to rank with persons of culture and high principle.

Doctor of Letters or Doctor of Fine Arts

Distinguished service to letters, art, music or education, coupled with intellectual and moral qualities that are widely recognized.

Doctor of Science

Distinguished service to science, coupled with personal qualities and a kind of learning that entitle the recipient to recognition by a learned educational body of high standing.

Doctor of Humane Letters

Distinguished service of a general nature, coupled with personal qualities and a kind of learning that entitle the recipient to recognition by a learned educational body of high standing.

Commencement Speaker

Since the commencement speaker will also be awarded an honorary degree, nominations for a speaker should follow the same guidelines as honorary degree candidates.

Confidentiality

Nomination information submitted will be kept confidential. Confidentiality at all points in the nominating process is crucial. No discussion concerning nominees should take place outside of those directly involved in the evaluation process or the formal evaluation and selection meetings. The President, or a designee, is responsible for contacting the candidates once the Board of Governors has approved a slate of candidates.

Exceptions

At Rutgers, honorary degrees are not awarded posthumously, unless the offer has been made and accepted prior to the individual's death. Also, honorary degrees are not awarded to the following:

- Current faculty or staff
- Current holders of political office, except that an honorary degree shall be awarded to the Governor of the State of New Jersey in the year the Governor takes office
- · Current university governing board members

Except in extraordinary circumstances, persons who have spent the greater part of their careers as members of the Rutgers faculty or administration will not be considered. However, persons otherwise associated with the university such as alumni, former governors and trustees, or distinguished visiting faculty will be considered.

Exceptions to these procedures, including the deadlines contained herein, may be made at the discretion of the President and the Board of Governors.

PROCEDURES

Nomination Form

Nominations must be made using the Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Nomination Form available online at http://ruweb.rutgers.edu/governance/secretary/hondegrees.shtml.

Nominators should include with their nomination form a curriculum vitae, if available, or biographical information and any other supporting materials. A well-written nomination form is often more persuasive than a lengthy curriculum vitae. The Committee may, at its discretion, request additional information from a nominator.

Holdover Nominations

Past nominees must be renominated each year; there will be no nominations held over from prior years. Therefore, if you have nominated someone in the past and would like that person to be reconsidered, please renominate the individual.

Deadline for Submission of Nominations

Typically, nominations need to be received by the Office of the Secretary the first week of October. Each fall, the Secretary of the University will announce a call for nominations and provide the university community with a deadline for submissions. Please keep in mind that because this process involves extensive administrative planning and coordination of schedules with the recipients, the Committee begins its work approximately 18 months in advance of the commencement date.

Appendix II: Revised (current) Rutgers guidelines



GUIDELINES ON HONORARY DEGREES

Honorary Degrees

Rutgers University invites nominations from any member of the university community or the public. A committee headed by the University President considers the nominations of individuals to receive honorary degrees. The President presents a final slate of candidates for review by the Board of Governors' Committee on Alumni and University Relations, which then makes a final recommendation on the honorary degree candidates to the full Board of Governors for their approval.

Criteria for Awarding an Honorary Degree by Rutgers University

The nominee for an honorary degree from Rutgers University:

- 1. Must evidence outstanding achievement in the humanities, arts, or sciences, or in a profession; in government, public affairs, education, or religion; in industry or commerce; or in an auxiliary field or endeavor.
- Must evidence distinguished service and performance in his or her accomplishments that support the ideals of Rutgers and serve as an example to our students, our alumni, and society.
- 3. Must evidence in his or her life a commitment of service to humankind.

Honorary degrees will be bestowed by the President at the University Commencement ceremony, or by the President, or a designee, at other university commencement ceremonies or special events. Degrees may be awarded in four categories based on the specific criteria listed below:

Doctor of Laws

Distinguished service to state or to nation, to learning or to humankind, coupled with intellectual gifts and moral qualities that entitle the recipient to rank with persons of culture and high principle.

Doctor of Letters or Doctor of Fine Arts

Distinguished service to letters, art, music or education, coupled with intellectual and moral qualities that are widely recognized.

Doctor of Science

Distinguished service to science, coupled with personal qualities and a kind of learning that entitle the recipient to recognition by a learned educational body of high standing.

Doctor of Humane Letters

Distinguished service of a general nature, coupled with personal qualities and a kind of learning that entitle the recipient to recognition by a learned educational body of high standing.

Confidentiality

Nomination information submitted will be kept confidential. Confidentiality at all points in the nominating process is crucial. No discussion concerning nominees should take place outside of those directly involved in the evaluation process. The President, or a designee, is responsible for contacting the candidates once the Board of Governors has approved a slate of candidates.

Exceptions

At Rutgers, honorary degrees are not awarded posthumously, unless the offer has been made and accepted prior to the individual's death. Also, honorary degrees are not awarded to the following:

- Current faculty or staff
- Current holders of political office, except that an honorary degree shall be awarded to the Governor of the State of New Jersey in the year the Governor takes office
- Current university governing board members, except that an honorary degree shall be awarded to the Chair of the Board of Governors at the conclusion of his or her term as chair of the Board

Except in extraordinary circumstances, persons who have spent the greater part of their careers as members of the Rutgers faculty or administration will not be considered. However, persons otherwise associated with the university such as alumni, former governors and trustees, or distinguished visiting faculty will be considered.

Exceptions to these procedures may be made at the discretion of the President and the Board of Governors.

The Nomination Process

Nominations will be accepted on an ongoing basis and should be forwarded to the Secretary of the University. If you have nominated someone in the past and would like that person to be reconsidered, please renominate the individual.

Nominations must be made using the standardized Honorary Degree Nomination Form available online at http://ruweb.rutgers.edu/governance/secretary/hondegrees.shtml.

Nominators should include with their nomination form a curriculum vitae, if available, or biographical information and any other supporting materials. A well-written nomination form is often more persuasive than a lengthy curriculum vitae. Submit nominations and supporting documentation electronically to secretary@oldqueens.rutgers.edu or by U. S. Postal Service or campus mail to:

Secretary of the University Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey 7 College Avenue Winants Hall, Room 112, College Avenue Campus New Brunswick, NJ 08901-1260

Appendix III.

Universities representing the Committee on Institutional Cooperation (CIC) and Public AAUs Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Selection Processes

Indiana University (AAU, CIC)

Responsible office University Faculty Council, Office of University Ceremonies

Links Guidelines:

http://www.iu.edu/~ufc/docs/policies/HonoraryDegree.pdf http://ceremonies.iu.edu/medals/honorary_degrees.shtml

Past recipients:

https://honorsandawards.iu.edu/university/honorary-degrees.shtml

Recommendation process Hond

Honorary Degrees Committee forward nominees to the Faculty Council for a vote. After approval by the University Faculty Council, the nominations are transmitted to the President of the University for submission to the Board of Trustees for formal action

Composition of selection committee

Honorary Degrees Committee (HDC; standing committee of the University Faculty Council): membership is composed of four members President. The chairperson is one of the four Council members selected in consultation with the President; faculty council votes 1 to 2 of the University Faculty Council selected by the Nomination Committee, and four members from outside the Council selected by the years prior to commencement

Nominations All nominations are referred to the Honorary Degrees Committee

Process unknown; commencement ceremonies at each campus; Bloomington campus has ceremonies in December and May Selection of

commencement speaker

Michigan State University (AAU, CIC)

Responsible office Office of the Vice President for Research and Graduate Studies

Links Guidelines:

http://commencement.msu.edu/speakers and honorarydegrees http://vprgs.msu.edu/guidelines-nominations-honorary-degrees

Honorary degree nomination materials:

http://vprgs.msu.edu/sites/default/files/Honorary%20Degree%20Nomination%20Form%20Spring%202014%20check%20boxes.pdf

Past degree recipients:

http://vprgs.msu.edu/msu-honorary-degree-recipients-alphabetical-list

Past speakers:

http://commencement.msu.edu/general-information/speakers/past_speakers

Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees advises the president Recommendation process

Faculty Committee on Honorary Degrees: 11 members (9 faculty, 2 administrators); terms of 3 years Composition of selection

committee

Solicited university-wide, coordinated through the dean's office of the nominating college. Deadline in September Nominations

Selection of

Separate process: students nominate speakers to the office of the president; president also has option of designating speakers for the

commencement ceremonies to receive honorary degrees commencement speaker

Northwestern University (Private AAU, CIC)

Office of the Provost Responsible office

Guidelines: Links attp://www.northwestern.edu/provost/committees/honorary-degrees/

Past recipients:

http://www.northwestern.edu/provost/committees/honorary-degrees/honorary-degree-recipients.html

Commencement speaker selection:

http://www.northwestern.edu/newscenter/stories/2013/06/commencement-speaker-selection-process.html#sthash.0uMMJcBc.dpuf

Recommendation process

transmits its recommendations to the Board of Trustees for final approval. Once the Board of Trustees approves the recommendations Recommendations of the Committee on Honorary Degrees are reviewed and voted on by the Faculty Senate each fall. The Senate then

from the Faculty Senate, formal invitations are issued to the individuals

committee

Committee on Honorary Degrees: 9 faculty, 3 *ex officio* staff; term of 1 year Composition of selection

Nominations are received by the Provost's office (Secretary, Committee on Honorary Degrees) from the university community; Nominations

nominations should be received by August the year prior to commencement

It is Northwestern tradition that the commencement speaker also be awarded an honorary degree from the University. So after the president makes a selection and availability is confirmed, the speaker's name is forwarded to the University's honorary degree Selection of commencement speaker

committee for review and on to the faculty senate and the executive committee of the Board of Trustees for approval

Ohio State University (AAU, CIC)

University Senate serves as advisory to the President/Board of Trustees Responsible office

Guidelines:

http://senate.osu.edu/?page id=219

Honorary degree nomination materials:

http://senate.osu.edu/?page id=3401

Past degree recipients:

http://senate.osu.edu/?page id=3115

Past speakers:

http://library.osu.edu/find/collections/the-ohio-state-university-archives/buckeye-history/commencement-addresses/alphabeticallisting-of-speakers/

After consultation with the University Senate, the President makes a recommendation to the Board of Trustees Recommendation process

Honorary Degrees Committee: 7 tenure-track faculty that are members of the University Senate; no more than 2 from the same college; Composition of selection

committee terms of 5 years. Duties and responsibilities:

(1) Establish definite standards of scholarly attainment (2) Establish procedures for the nomination of potential candidates for honorary degrees

(3) Receive nominations concerning persons who might be considered for an honorary degree

(4) Review thoroughly the achievements and qualifications of all persons nominated (each forwarded packet must receive no fewer

than 4 votes)

(5) Report to the university senate for its consideration: voting by senate membership by ballot; advisory to the President

Solicited university-side, number of nominees forwarded to the president is limited to 8 per calendar year Nominations

Selection of Process unknown

commencement speaker

Pennsylvania State University (AAU, CIC)

Responsible office of the Vice President for Administration

Links Guidelines and past recipients: http://www.psu.edu/ur/poole/honorary.html

Process unknown; very little information on the process posted to the website Recommendation process

Composition of selection Process unknown committee

Honorary Degree nominations are accepted throughout the year by the Office of the Vice President for Administration Nominations

Selection of Process unknown

commencement speaker

Purdue University (AAU, CIC)

Board of Trustees Responsible office

Guidelines: Links http://www3.ag.purdue.edu/dean/facultyinfo/Documents/Hon%20Doc%20Process%20at%20Purdue.pdf

Past recipients:

http://www.science.purdue.edu/Alumni/recognition/honorary doctorates/index.html

Recommendation process

Candidates for an Honorary Doctorate are first identified by their department, and then endorsed by their college or school. Next, an

"all-University committee" discusses candidates and finally the President and Board of Trustees give approval

Composition of selection

"All University" committee, but composition is unknown

committee

All nominations for honorary degrees are reviewed by the appropriate faculty, the dean of the college/school, and the University Committee on Faculty Promotions Nominations

Process unknown

Selection of

commencement speaker

Rutgers University (AAU, CIC)

Secretary of the University Responsible office

Guidelines (includes links to guidelines and nomination forms): Links

http://universitysecretary.rutgers.edu/honorary-degree-nomination/honorary-degree-nomination-process

Past degree recipients:

http://universitysecretary.rutgers.edu/degrees

New Brunswick/RBHS: Committee on Honorary Degrees advises the President who advises the Board of Governors Recommendation process

Camden: an honorary degree committee advises the Chancellor who advises the Board of Governors

Newark: Rutgers-Newark Honorary Degree Committee advises the Chancellor who advises the Board of Governors

New Brunswick/RBHS: Committee on Honorary Degrees: members include the University president, the New Brunswick and RBHS Chancellors, a member of the Board of Governors, a member of the Board of Trustees, and 2 faculty members Composition of selection committee

Camden: honorary degree committee appointed by the Chancellor consisting of the Vice-Chancellor as well as faculty representing each

academic unit

Newark: 7 faculty and the Vice-Chancellor for Public Affairs

For the 2014 commencement ceremony: solicited by each campus individually Nominations

New Brunswick/RBHS: nominations solicited from the university community and public by the Secretary of the University, nominations

accepted on an on-going basis

Camden: Vice-Chancellor from the Camden community

Newark: Chancellor from the academic and administrative leadership

Commencement speaker chosen from among those selected for honorary degrees Selection of

commencement speaker

University of Chicago (Private AAU, CIC)

Office of the Secretary Responsible office

Past recipients:

attp://convocation.uchicago.edu/page/honorary-degrees

Past speakers:

http://convocation.uchicago.edu/page/speakers

Committee members:

https://sof.sites.uchicago.edu/page/2013-2014-committee-honorary-degrees

Degrees are conferred by the Board of Trustees upon recommendation of the Council of the University Senate Recommendation process

The Committee on Honorary Degrees: 10 faculty, 2 ex officio (President, Provost); serve 3-year terms. The committee is associated with the Council of the University Senate, but the relationship is not clear Composition of selection

committee

University faculty nominate candidates at the level of degree-granting units Nominations

nominate candidates at the level of degree-granting units. Departmental honorary degree committees collect letters of recommendation Convocations are held at the end of each academic quarter. Convocation speakers are members of the faculty. University faculty from outside scholars as well as complete bibliographies of the candidates. They make their recommendations to the divisional Selection of commencement speaker

committees, which then make their recommendations to the deans

University of Illinois at Chicago (public research institution)

Responsible office Senate External Affairs Committee serves as advisory to the Chancellor/Board of Trustees

Links Guidelines:

http://www.uic.edu/depts/senate/HonoraryDegreeGuidelines.pdf

Past degree recipients:

http://www.uic.edu/depts/ovcsa/commencement/honorary degrees.shtml

Past speakers:

http://www.uic.edu/depts/ovcsa/commencement/commencement speakers.shtml

Recommendation process Se

Senate Committee on External Affairs and Public Service prepares packets and advises the Chancellor, who with the President, trustees, and key advisors, ensures that the nominee(s) are acceptable. Chancellor advises the Board of Trustees.

Composition of selection The

The Senate Committee on External Affairs and Public Service includes: chair and 4 senior faculty selected by the Senate; 1

representative of the provost's office; 2 students; Associate-Chancellor (ex officio); serve a term of 5 years committee

Members of the university community are solicited; nomination packets are forwarded to the Senate office in fall; recommendations are

Nominations Members of the un

made in year 2 for awarding in years 3 or 4; no more than 3 degrees are awarded per year

Selection of Each college selects a separate speaker commencement speaker

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (AAU, CIC)

Responsible office Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees

Links Nomination process:

http://www.senate.illinois.edu/hd_criteria.asp

Nomination materials:

http://www.senate.illinois.edu/hd_form.pdf

Past recipients:

http://commencement.illinois.edu/ceremonies/honors awards.html

Senate bylaws:

http://senate.illinois.edu/bylaws hd.asp

Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees forwards names to the Senate for approval; Senate advises the Provost/Chancellor who advises Recommendation process

the President

Composition of selection S

Senate Committee on Honorary Degrees (7 senators: 5 faculty, 2 students); 2-year terms

Nominations

Nominations are forwarded to the Chair of the Senate; ongoing process. Senate guidelines emphasize recommendations by departments and other academic units. A nomination coming to the Committee from a member of the Board of Trustees, an alumnus/alumna or friend of the University will be referred to the proper academic unit for support of the faculty

Selection of commencement speaker

Process unknown, but not necessarily recipient of an honorary degree. Minutes of one Senate meeting stated that the Senate EC acted on behalf of the Senate to award the commencement speaker an honorary degree.

University of Iowa (AAU, CIC)

Board of Regents Responsible office

Guidelines: Links ittp://www.uiowa.edu/~honorary/index.html

http://www.uiowa.edu/~honorary/policy/

Nomination materials:

http://www.uiowa.edu/~honorary/nomination-form/index.html

Past recipients:

http://www.uiowa.edu/~honorary/recipients/index.html

Recommendation process

Honorary Degrees Selection Committee advises the Provost, President, and Board of Regents

Composition of selection

The Honorary Degree Committee consists of the following voting members: 5 associate/full professors (selected by the Faculty Senate members serve 3-year terms. The Faculty Senate Committee on Committees shall appoint the chair of the Honorary Degree Selection to ensure ethnic and gender balance); 2 associate/full professors selected by the Provost; 1 ex officio from the Provost's Office; committee

Committee from the list of seven faculty appointees.

Nominations should be sent to the Honorary Degree Selection Committee; nominations close 9 months prior to commencement Nominations

Process unknown Selection of

commencement speaker

University of Maryland at College Park (AAU, CIC)

Board of Regents Responsible office

Guidelines:

http://www.president.umd.edu/policies/iii300anew.html

Past degree recipients:

http://www.lib.umd.edu/univarchives/macmil/honorarydegrees1.html

Past speakers:

http://www.commencement.umd.edu/information/information pastspeakers.cfm

President nominates the Committee on Honors and Prizes, who advises (in succession) the: University President, Chancellor, Board of Recommendation process

Regents

Committee on Honors and Prizes; voting members include faculty and administrators Composition of selection

committee

Committee on Honors and Prizes solicits nominations from the campus community Nominations

Process unknown Selection of commencement speaker

University of Michigan (AAU, CIC)

Board of Regents Responsible office

Guidelines: Links http://president.umich.edu/about/committees/honorary-degree-committee/

Honorary degree nomination materials:

http://president.umich.edu/about/committees/honorary-degree-committee/honorary-degree-committee-nomination-submission/

Past degree recipients:

http://president.umich.edu/about/committees/honorary-degree-committee/history-of-the-honorary-degree-at-the-university-ofmichigan/

Past speakers:

http://president.umich.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2014/06/speakers1930-1989.pdf http://president.umich.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2014/06/speakers1990-2013.pdf

http://president.umich.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2014/06/speakers1878-1929.pdf

Recommendation process

Honorary Degree Committee, who advises the University President and the Board of Regents

Dean of graduate Studies, chair, 7 members of the University Senate; faculty representing the Ann Arbor (5), Dearborn (1), and Flint (1) Honorary Degree Committee, appointed by the Board of Regents on recommendation of the University President; members include the Composition of selection

campuses; 2 students; 2 alumni; 6 administrators including President (ex officio); 3 year term; meets twice yearly for a March deadline

Solicited university-wide Nominations Selected by the president, usually from among pool of those who receive honorary degrees Selection of

commencement speaker

University of Minnesota, Twin Cities (AAU, CIC)

University Senate Responsible office

Guidelines:

nttp://uawards.umn.edu/

http://www1.umn.edu/usenate/alluhonors/hd_guidelines.pdf http://www1.umn.edu/usenate/committees/alluhonors.html

Board of Regents policy

http://regents.umn.edu/sites/default/files/policies/Awards.pdf

Honorary degree nomination materials:

http://uawards.umn.edu/uawards/award_pages/hd.html

Past recipients:

http://uawards.umn.edu/uawards/recipients/hd_rec.html

Committee charge:

http://www1.umn.edu/usenate/charges/alluhonorsch.html

Senate All-University Awards Committee advises the University President who advises the Board of Regents Recommendation process Senate All-University Awards Committee: members include the chair, 7 faculty 2 representatives of civil service, 5 alumni, 2 academic Composition of selection

committee

Nominations are solicited from current employees or alumni of the university by the Director of University Awards and Honors on professionals, 3 students, and 6 ex officio as specified by vote of the Senate; decisions are made 6 months prior to ceremony Nominations

behalf of the Senate All-University Awards Committee

Process unknown Selection of

commencement speaker

University of Nebraska-Lincoln (CIC)

Faculty Senate **Guidelines:** Responsible office

attp://www.unl.edu/facultysenate/honorary-degrees-committee

The Honorary Degrees Committee of the Faculty Senate recommends candidates to the Faculty Senate; members vote by secret ballot; names of those receiving simple majority vote are forwarded to the President of the Senate to the Chancellor for submission to the Recommendation process

Board of Regents

The Honorary Degrees Committee shall consist of 7 members: 5 faculty members appointed by the President of the Faculty Senate; 1 faculty member appointed by the Dean of Libraries; and the Chancellor, or designee; committee members serve 3-year terms committee Composition of selection

The Honorary Degrees Committee shall invite nominations from colleges and appropriate administrative units Nominations

Selection of Process unknown commencement speaker

University of Pennsylvania (Private AAU)

Responsible office Office of the University Secretary

Links Guidelines:

https://secure.www.upenn.edu/secretary/HDhome.html

Honorary degree nomination materials:

https://secure.www.upenn.edu/secretary/HonoraryDegrees.php

Past recipients:

https://secure.www.upenn.edu/secretary/honorary.html

Past speakers:

https://secure.www.upenn.edu/secretary/speakers38.html

University Council Honorary Degrees Committee advises the Trustee Committee on Honorary Degrees and Awards Recommendation process

The University Council Honorary Degrees Committee includes 8 faculty, 2 graduate/professional students, 2 undergraduate students Composition of selection

committee and staff liaisons

Nominations Nominations are solicited university-wide by the selection committee

Administered through the Office of the Secretary and advisory to the University President Selection of

commencement speaker

University of Wisconsin-Madison (AAU, CIC)

Responsible office Secretary of the Faculty

Links Guidelines:

https://www.secfac.wisc.edu/committees/honorarydegrees/NominatingProcedures.htm

Past recipients:

https://www.secfac.wisc.edu/committees/honorarydegrees/PastRecipients.asp

Past speakers:

http://www.commencement.wisc.edu/past-ceremonies/

Committee on Honorary Degrees advises the Chancellor who advises the Board of Regents Recommendation process Committee on Honorary Degrees: 28 members including the Chancellor, University President, 16 faculty selected by the faculty [four from each division], 10 faculty or administration appointed by the Chancellor; deadline is October Composition of selection

committee

Nominations are solicited from faculty and staff with an April deadline (year prior to commencement) Nominations

Process unknown; commencement speakers include chancellors and do not appear to be recipients of honorary degrees Selection of commencement speaker

APPENDIX B



Rutgers University Senate University Structure and Governance Committee November 2015 Amended February/April 2016

Response to Charge S-1410 on Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Selection Processes - Amended

Charge S-1410: Honorary Degree and Commencement Speaker Selection Processes and Related Senate Committee: Formulate details of processes to be used to facilitate the <u>proposal submitted to President Barchi on Charge S-1405 on Procedures for Selecting Commencement Speakers and Honorary Degree Recipients.</u> [See also President Barchi's response to that proposal.]

Background: Rutgers has used multiple mechanisms for selecting honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers over the last several years. The selection of Condoleezza Rice as the 2014 commencement speaker and honorary-degree recipient, and the ensuing controversy, demonstrated the need for a more open process to vet and select recipients.

The University Senate Executive Committee, on the Senate's behalf, discussed, formulated, and proposed to President Barchi a plan to provide input from representatives of all Rutgers constituent groups¹. President Barchi agreed with some of the provisions of the report, but asked for modifications to some others. With modifications to the original proposal, the Executive Committee then constituted an ad hoc committee to review nominations for honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers for the 2015 and 2016 New Brunswick/Rutgers Biomedical and Health Sciences (RBHS) commencement ceremonies, and make recommendations based on the members' perceived appropriateness of the nominees. The Newark Chancellor and Camden Provost constituted similar committees for their own units², which were to include the Senate Executive Committee members of their respective units.

¹ University Senate report S-1405 Procedures for Selecting Commencement Speakers and Honorary Degree Recipients:

http://senate.rutgers.edu/EConS1405HonoraryDegreesCommencementSpeakersWithAppendicesJuly2014.pdf

² In this document, the term "units" references the following Rutgers University entities: Rutgers University – Camden (R-C), Rutgers University – Newark (R-N), Rutgers University – New Brunswick (R-NB), and Rutgers Biomedical and Health Sciences (RBHS)

In this modified process, the Office of the Secretary of the University sent nominations and corresponding documentation to the Executive Secretary of the Senate for R-NB and RBHS nominees, and directly to the chancellors of R-N and R-C for their respective unit's nominees. The Executive Secretary of the University Senate then convened the Ad Hoc Honorary Degree Committee for the R-NB/RBHS commencement.

This process helped to provide the framework for the overarching University Commencement Panel (UCP) and the unit-specific Commencement Committees (CC) proposed later in this report. The design of that model is intended to ensure that the recommended Commencement Committees for all parts of the system are able to form, and to provide appropriate vetting of all potential candidates.

Considerations: Senate Executive Committee Report S-1405 states:

"It is clear that, given recent changes in University structure and the replacement of a university-wide commencement by three separate campus-based commencements, a new policy inclusive of adequate representation of faculty, students, staff, and alumni is needed. In keeping with the desire for free and open discourse within the Rutgers community, the Executive Committee on behalf of the Senate made recommendations for a revised policy for selection of honorary degree recipients and commencement speakers."

(The full report by the Executive Committee can be found at http://senate.rutgers.edu/EConS1405HonoraryDegreesCommencementSpeakersWithAppendicesJuly2014.pdf.)

For the purposes of the 2017 commencement and beyond, the Senate's University Structure and Governance Committee (USGC) has been tasked to discuss, develop, and recommend a process and committee structure that will discuss and rank nominees.

Subsequent USGC discussions recognized that:

- i) The University Senate is the one body that encompasses all of our communities.
- ii) University commencement is a time to celebrate the achievements of the undergraduate and graduate students and the faculty.
- iii) Honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers bring attention to the role and impact of Rutgers University in our society.
- iv) Awarding honorary degrees and inviting commencement speakers honors those who are selected by the University, and reflects on the vibrancy and mission of the University within the State of New Jersey, the United States, and the world.
- v) The selection process should be inclusive, transparent, and flexible.

After deliberating, the USGC adopted the following recommendations regarding the process to select honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers.

Recommendations

I. Committees

- 1. Create a component of the University Senate, named "University Commencement Panel" (UCP)
 - i) The UCP will be composed of members with representation from each unit (R-C, R-N, R-NB, RBHS), as follows:
 - a. Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting)
 - b. Vice Chair of the Senate (chair of UCP)
 - c. Four Faculty Senators, with each of the following groups being represented:
 - Tenure-track (TT), non-tenure-track (NTT), and part-time lecturers (PTL)
 - d. One Staff Senator
 - e. One Alumni Senator
 - f. Two Student Senators
 - ii) The UCP will be responsible for:
 - a. Convening at least twice per year
 - b. Soliciting, from among the membership of the Senate, nominations for membership on Commencement Committees (CC), as defined below
 - c. Selecting, from among those nominations for CCs, three faculty members and two students for each of the CCs
- 2. Once a year, the University Senate's Executive Committee will:
 - i) solicit nominations from the University Senate for membership on the UCP
 - ii) appoint members to the UCP from among those nominations
- 3. Commencement Committees will:
 - i) be appointed by the respective chancellor(s) for each of the following commencement ceremonies <u>prior to solicitation of nominations by the Secretary of the University:</u>
 - a. R-C
 - b. R-N
 - c. R-NB/RBHS
 - ii) be comprised of:
 - a. four designees³ chosen by that unit's chancellor

³ In the case of the combined R-NB/RBHS commencement, both chancellors will make those appointments from among the respective R-NB and RBHS constituencies. For the chancellors' four

- b. five Senators³ from that unit, consisting of three faculty and two students selected by the UCP
- iii) select their chair from among the members of their CC
- iv) research and consider those individuals nominated for:
 - a. an honorary degree from their unit
 - b. invitation to speak at their commencement

II. Selection Process

- Each year, the Secretary of the University will provide each CC with nomination packets for their respective units (the RBHS-New Brunswick CC will receive the packets for each of those two units). Confidentiality regarding the names and credentials of nominees shall be observed by the CCs.
- 2. Each CC will evaluate their nomination packets, and will compile a list of those candidates they find suitable to receive an honorary degree and/or as a commencement speaker. Note that a nominee could potentially be selected as both honorary-degree recipient and commencement speaker. The approved candidates will be ranked by the committee, and submitted as a packet to the respective chancellor(s). Copies of the packets shall also be sent to the Secretary of the University.
- 3. In consultation with the University President, each of the chancellors will select honorary-degree recipient(s) and commencement speaker(s) from their CC's rankings list of approved candidates, and will forward their selections to the Board of Governors' Committee on University Relations for endorsement consideration, who, in line with current practice, will forward the names of those proposed honorary-degree recipients and commencement speakers to the Board of Governors for approval.
- 4. No final candidates shall be selected without having been considered by the respective CC.

Resolution:

Be it resolved that the University Senate:

Endorses the USGC's Recommendations as contained in this report regarding the process to select honorary-degree recipients and commencement

designees, two will be from R-NB and two from RBHS. For the two Student Senators, one each from R-NB and RBHS. For the three Faculty Senators, at least one from R-NB and at least one from RBHS.

speakers; and asks the University administration to implement that process going forward, starting with 2017 commencement.

Be it further resolved, that if these recommendations are accepted by the University, then the Handbook of the Rutgers University Senate should be updated as follows.

i) In Article VII. B., the sentence

"The vice chair acts as chair of the Appeals Panel if an appeal is being heard, and reports on Executive Committee action at Senate meetings." should be replaced with the sentence

"The vice chair acts as chair of the University Commencement Panel and of the Appeals Panel if an appeal is being heard, and reports on Executive Committee action at Senate meetings."

ii) In Article VIII. A., the sentence

"Procedures concerning the structure and operation of committees were approved by the University Senate on May 5, 1974, and amended April 28, 1995."

should be replaced with the sentence

"Procedures concerning the structure and operation of committees were approved by the University Senate on May 5, 1974, and amended April 28, 1995 and [INSERT DATE OF THIS AMENDMENT'S ADOPTION]."

iii) In Article VIII. D., append the following text

"11. University Commencement Panel

Standing Charge: The University Commencement Panel (UCP) shall be appointed by the Executive Committee at the beginning of each year and shall consist of the Vice Chair of the Senate, serving as chair of the UCP; four faculty senators (one each from Camden, Newark, New Brunswick, and RBHS, and including at least one tenure-track, one non-tenure-track, and one part-time lecturer senator); two student senators; one staff senator; one alumni senator; and the Executive Secretary of the Senate (non-voting). Members will be appointed to this panel in addition to their regular committee duties, with the following responsibilities:

- Identify and select faculty and student senators to serve on the Camden, Newark, and New Brunswick/RBHS Commencement Committees (which vet and rank nominations for honorary degrees and for commencement speakers), as follows:
 - o three faculty senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
 - two student senators from the respective campus (in the case of New Brunswick/RBHS, at least one from each)
- Advise the chancellors on a timely basis of the names of those selected for appointment."

University Structure and Governance Committee 2015 - 2016

Oliver, Jon, NB Staff, Co-Chair

Puhak, Robert, FAS-N (F), Co-Chair

Ahmed, Sultan, NJMS (F)

Anderson, Ellen Zambo, SHRP (F)

Delnevo, Christine, Alumni Association

DiVito, Timothy, Camden Staff

Eastman, Wayne, At-Large N (F)

Edward, David, Newark Staff

Esposito, Adrienne, NB Staff

Ganesh, Jaishankar, SB-C Dean (A)

Holzer, Marc, SPAA Dean (A)

Hughes, James, EJBSPPP Dean (A)

Janniger, Edmund, SPAA (S)

Mahon, Gwendolyn, SHRP Dean (A)

Maruna, Shadd, SCJ Dean (A)

Moran, Elizabeth, RBHS At-Large (F)

Oberdiek, John, Law-C Dean (A)

O'Connell, Claire, SHRP (F)

Palmer, Daniel, Law-N, (S)

Parisi, Nicholas, SAS-NB (S)

Pusukur, Bharani, Engineering (S)

Scott, Kathleen, SAS-NB (F)

Settles, Alex, RBS:N/NB (F)

Sharp, Jane, GS-NB (F)

Shinbrot, Troy, Engineering (F)

Swalagin, Kenneth, Senate Executive Secretary (Non-Senator)

Thomas, Andrew, NJMS (F)

Williams, Alexandra, SAS-NB, (S)

University Structure and Governance Committee 2014-2015

Oliver, Jon, NB Staff, Co-Chair

Puhak, Robert, FAS-N (F), Co-Chair

Admani, Saad, RBS-N (S)

Ahmed, Sultan, NJMS (F)

Anderson, Ellen, SHRP (F)

Aubry, Marie, SAS-NB (F)

Delnevo, Christine, Alumni Association

DiVito, Timothy, Camden Staff

Eastman, Wayne, At-Large N (F)

Edward, David, Newark Staff

Ganesh, Jaishankar, SB-C Dean (A)

Gomes, Richard, PTL-N (F)

Holzer, Marc, SPAA Dean (A)

Hughes, James, EJBSPPP Dean (A)

Janniger, Edmund, SPAA (S)

Karamichael, Kenneth, NB Staff

Krishnamurthi, Bharath, Engineering (S)

Mahon, Gwendolyn, SHRP Dean (A)

Mitra, Akash, SEBS (S)

Mitchell, Sean, FAS-N (F)

Moran, Elizabeth, RBHS At-Large (F)

Oberdiek, John, Law-C Dean (A)

O'Connell, Claire, SHRP (F)

Schulberg Justin, SAS-NB (S)

Settles, Alex, RBS:N/NB (F) Shulman, Jacob, SAS-NB (S) Swalagin, Kenneth, Senate Executive Secretary (Non-Senator) Svasti, Luke, SAS-NB (S) Triner Gail, GS-NB (F)