

FPAC Response to charge S1909-1

Searches for University Leadership

The Charge:

Investigate the processes, including those used by the Big 10 and AAU Institutions, to identify senior leaders and recommend best practices at Rutgers.

Background:

- In the latest search for the university president the BOG formed a search committee without getting input from the Senate or the university student/faculty/staff
- Identities of members of this search committee were not made public, although the BOG assured the Senate that faculty were involved in the committee
- The Senate EC created this charge for the FPAC so that the committee examines the search process for the senior leadership hiring
- Upon request for further clarification, the Senate President and Vice President stressed that the scope of this charge is intentionally broad and it is up to FPAC to decide which leadership categories they wish to cover

What peer institution do

- We sent e-mail to several Senate presidents from the Big ten, the PAC ten and some other large and well-known peer state universities, asking about their president and other senior leadership search process
- Among those who responded were
 - The University of Michigan
 - The University of Wisconsin
 - Pennsylvania State University
 - University of Maryland
 - University of California-Berkeley

Some Responses and policies follow:

The University of Wisconsin

- The Board of Regents appoints the search committee for search of University-wide President
- The President appoints committee for search of Campus Chancellor
- There are quotas:
 - Five are from the Board itself
 - Two faculty, and one staff and one student
- President of search committee is chosen by the board from a board member
- Vice president is chosen from one of faculty members
- The web site for their policy can be found in:
<https://www.wisconsin.edu/regents/policies/selection-process-for-system-president-chancellors-vice-chancellors-and-uw-system-senior-leadership-positions/>

The University of Minnesota

- The Board of Regents *is* the search committee
- They consult with the University Senate and get advice to add faculty/staff/student members to the search committee
- They ask for up to twice as many proposed members of search committee so that they have “flexibility” to choose
- The Senate special committee and “representatives” of faculty, staff, students are allowed to participate in the finalists’ interviews
- The web site for their policy can be found in:
https://humanresources.umn.edu/sites/humanresources.umn.edu/files/sup034-04_university_senate_committee_involvement_in_hiring_selected_leaders_tc_morris_rochester.pdf

The University of Maryland

- At Maryland, the search committee is appointed by the Board of Regents
- The names of members of search committees are made public
- Many are from the Board itself, or the administration (deans, University Counsel,) or from donors

- The web site for their recent committee is: <https://umd.edu/presidential-search/presidential-search-process/search-committee>

University of California-Berkeley

- In the last Search for Berkeley Chancellor in 2016 The UC System President appointed the search committee
- She selected five faculty members (one who is the Senate chair, and one from a UC campus other than Berkeley,) and one each from undergrad students, grad students, staff, UC foundation and alumni
- The website for their latest hire is: <https://chancellor.berkeley.edu/uc-berkeley-chancellor-selection-faq>

Communication with the University of Michigan Director of Faculty Senate

"Dear Professor Alizadeh,

The University of Michigan is beginning the process of examining its practices concerning hiring of deans and other high level administrators, so we don't currently have best practices to share. We had a scandal last year where UM's provost was embroiled in sexual harassment issues of his own. The provost ascended through the faculty ranks, served as a dean, and then was appointed as provost after years of inappropriate behavior that went unchecked. As a result, the Board of Regents hired a consulting firm in December that will be with us at least through the end of the year. I expect at the end of this process we will have robust procedures, but it will be a while.

I would very much appreciate hearing about what you learn from our peers if you're willing to share what you learn. When we come to the end of this process, I will be more than happy to share what procedures UM will put into place.

Good luck with this important work before you!

Best regards,

MaryJo

MaryJo Banasik, J.D., Ph.D.

Director, Faculty Senate Office"

The case for a more transparent policy for senior leadership searches

- We, the Rutgers staff, students and faculty, have an opportunity to make Rutgers a leader in transparency and in shared governance.

- Of course, the BOG, the President, and the chancellors have every right to appoint their trusted people to search committees. However, if some of the members are going to be from among staff, student and faculty, we think it is better if they are elected through their representatives or directly (in the case of deans.)
- The proposed Senate resolution attempts to capture this spirit of shared governance in the leadership search processes.

A quick summary of the proposed resolution:

For President and chancellors:

- university/campus wide volunteers announce their interest.
- A Senate ad hoc committee selects a short list
- Senators vote for the student/staff/faculty members of the committee
- The BOG/President must accept all as part of the eventual search committee

For Deans:

- Unit-wide election for student/staff/faculty of the unit's committee representatives will be held
- The Chancellor must accept all as part of eventual search committee

The identities of all members of search committees should be made public along with their CV/Resume

For the Executive Vice President and Provosts

- The suggested appointee has to be announced at least two Senate sessions before the formal appointment
- The university community can send their questions/concerns/praise to the Senate
- The Senate collects and summarizes them and communicates them to the President/Chancellor
- The President/Chancellor should come before the Senate and address these questions

Draft Resolution for Charge S1909-1

In the interest of shared governance be it resolved that:

1) For the search of the University president:

1. A university-wide announcement shall be made, and a call for nominations for the search committee shall be solicited. The invitation shall be extended to all the university faculty, students, and staff with at least one year of university participation prior to committee formation. Nominations shall be open to all faculty (including PTL's), students, and staff who meet eligibility conditions to be in the University Senate.
2. The Executive Committee of the University Senate shall form a special committee to review all search committee candidates based on diversity, representation, and eligibility. The Senate committee shall form a shortlist of search committee candidates and present it to the Senate.
3. The Senate shall vote on the search committee candidates from the shortlist and select a list of candidates whose number is equal to the number of the eventual search committee's student/faculty/staff members.
4. The Senate shall present its elected search committee candidates to The Board of Governors. The BOG shall include all the Senate elected members in the eventual search committee.
5. The identities of all members of the eventual search committee shall be made public along with a biography and relevant CV or resume.

2) For the search of University campus chancellors:

1. A campus-wide announcement shall be made, and a call for nominations for the search committee shall be solicited. The invitation shall be extended to all the campus faculty, students, and staff with at least one year of university participation prior to committee formation. Nominations shall be open to all faculty (including PTL's), students, and staff who meet eligibility conditions to be in the University Senate.
2. The Executive Committee of the University Senate shall form a special committee to review all search committee candidates based on diversity, representation, and eligibility. The Senate committee shall form a shortlist of search committee candidates and present it to the Senate.

3. The Senate shall vote on the search committee candidates and select a list of candidates whose number is equal to the number of the eventual search committee's student/faculty/staff members.
4. The Senate shall present its elected search committee candidates to The University President. The President shall include all the Senate elected members in the eventual search committee.
5. The identities of all members of the eventual search committee shall be made public along with a biography and relevant CV or resume.

3) For the search of University schools and other decanal units' deans:

1. An announcement shall be made by the Chancellor of the campus where the decanal unit is based, and nominations for the search committee shall be solicited from among the unit's students, faculty, and staff.
2. Elections shall be conducted among the decanal unit's students, who will vote for the student representatives in the search committee.
3. Elections shall be conducted among the decanal unit's faculty (including TT, NTT, and PTL's), who will vote for the faculty representatives in the search committee.
4. Elections shall be conducted among the decanal unit's staff, who will vote for the staff representatives in the search committee.
5. The decanal unit's dean shall present the results of these elections to the Chancellor of the campus to which the unit belongs.
6. The Chancellor must include the elected student/staff/faculty (including PTL's) as part of the eventual search committee.
7. The identities of all eventual dean search committee members shall be made public along with a biography and relevant CV or resume.

4) For the appointment of the University Executive Vice President:

1. The university president shall announce his/her choice for the EVP to the public and wait for at least two Senate sessions to make the appointment final.
2. The biography and CV or resume of the proposed EVP shall be made public by the president.

3. The university students/faculty/staff shall have an opportunity to examine the proposed candidate and, if there are questions, concerns, or objections, shall present them to the University Senate.
4. The University Senate shall summarize these concerns and present them to the University President.
5. The university president shall appear before the Senate and address the questions, concerns, and objections raised by the university community.

5) For the appointment of campus Provosts:

1. The campus chancellor shall announce his/her choice for the provost to the public and wait for at least two Senate sessions to make the appointment final.
2. The biography and CV or resume of the proposed provost shall be made public by the chancellor.
3. The campus students/faculty/staff shall have an opportunity to examine the proposed candidate and, if there are questions, concerns, or objections, shall present them to the University Senate.
4. The University Senate shall summarize these concerns and present them to the campus chancellor.
5. The campus chancellor shall appear before the Senate and address the questions, concerns, and objections raised by the campus community.

6) For the hiring of campus Vice Chancellors, in all their derivative titles:

1. The campus chancellor shall announce the opening of such a position to that campus community, a job posting will be created, and a search committee will be formed, composed of one other Vice Chancellor and of a Dean of that campus as co-chairs, along with other faculty, staff, and students
2. Following the committee's work, the campus chancellor will review the top 3 candidates and announce their selected candidate.
3. The biography and CV or resume of the proposed Vice Chancellor shall be made public by the chancellor.
4. The campus students/faculty/staff shall have an opportunity to examine the proposed candidate and, if there are questions, concerns, or objections, shall present them to the search committee.

5. The search committee shall summarize these concerns and present them to the campus chancellor.
6. The campus chancellor shall appear before the search committee and address the questions, concerns, and objections raised by the campus community.
7. If a Vice Chancellor role is to be a brand-new position, thus creating a new leadership role and/or Division for the campus, this role must first be supported by a majority of the faculty and staff of the campus. If such a majority is obtained, the process for hiring a Vice Chancellor, and all Vice Chancellor derivative titles (assistant vice chancellor, senior vice chancellor, etc.), shall begin at step 1 of this list.

7) The Senate shall put in place processes to administer both the election process for the president and chancellors' search committees. The Senate shall also put in place process to convey the faculty/staff/students' inputs to the president and chancellors for their appointed EVP and provosts.